



# California Public Utilities Commission



## CPUC ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL JUSTICE ACTION PLAN

2021 UPDATE WORKSHOP | FEBRUARY 3 & 4 | 10:00 – 3:00 PM

### Logs from Chat Boxes at Virtual Sessions

Below represents chat communication shared with “All Attendees” during the ESJ Workshop. Only personal email addresses and phone numbers that were shared in the chat have been redacted for the purposes of this log. The chat logs are organized by session. To view recordings of the workshop, please visit [www.cpuc.ca.gov/ESJActionPlan](http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/ESJActionPlan)

- [Welcome & Thanks](#)
- [ESJ Action Plan Overview & Workshop Details](#)
- [Defining ESJ: Understanding Definitions and Terms for CPUC Programs and Policies](#)
- [BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Transportation & Rail](#)
- [BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Telecommunications](#)
- [BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Wildfire Safety](#)
- [Systematizing ESJ Considerations: Incorporating ESJ Issues in to CPUC Proceedings and Processes](#)
- [Commissioner Welcome, Thanks, and Summary of Day 1](#)
- [Tracking and Measuring: Data Collection to Better Understand CPUC Impact in ESJ Communities](#)
- [Public Comment Session](#)
- [BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Energy](#)
- [BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Safety & Enforcement](#)
- [BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Water](#)
- [Making the Most of Marketing, Education & Outreach \(ME&O\): Maximizing Impact and Aligning Strategies](#)

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Wednesday February 3, 2021

## Welcome & Thanks

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 10:00 AM

Hi everyone, thank you for joining! We will give folks a few more minutes to join and then we will kick things off. Thanks!

from Matthew George to everyone: 10:02 AM

Good Morning, Everyone! Hope you are all well

from Rachel Peterson to everyone: 10:06 AM

is sergio translating in real time? do we need to adjust speaking pace?

from Jennifer Reyes Lagunero to everyone: 10:08 AM

I may have missed it, but is this workshop being recorded?

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 10:09 AM

Yes, this workshop will be recorded and available after the workshop.

from Daniel Taillant to everyone: 10:10 AM

Hello Everyone ... Daniel Taillant (he/him) here from the Center for Human Rights and Environment (CHRE) / IGSD

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 10:12 AM

Good morning Martha Armas-Kelly Catholic Charities EJ Program Stanislaus Co, marmaskelly

from Jennifer Capitolo to everyone: 10:12 AM

Hello all! Will the breakout sessions also be recorded? I'd like to attend more than one but the recording would also be helpful. Thank you!

from Daphne Lee to everyone: 10:13 AM

Will this be recorded?

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 10:13 AM

Hi everyone, yes the workshop will be recorded and posted after the workshop.

from Matthew George to everyone: 10:14 AM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Matthew George (He/him but any pronouns ok). I represent Caltrans before the Commission in several matters. I assume my attendance will not raise any ex parte concerns. but if they do, I will reluctantly wait for the recording rather than attend in person.

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 10:19 AM

Good morning and my thanks to the CPUC Commissioners and staff, as well as the DAC AG and others for all your work leading up to this workshop, My name is Alexandra McGee (she/ella) and I'm listening as a member of MCE, California's first Community Choice Agency, serving Napa, Marin, Contra Costa, and Solano Counties. Looking forward to learning from this workshop!

from Doug Karpa to everyone: 10:22 AM

Good morning all! Thanks very much for hosting this important conversation. I am Dr. Doug Karpa (he/him) and I am participating from Peninsula Clean Energy, which is the Community Choice Aggregator for San Mateo County. Looking forward to working together with our fellow agencies and other stakeholders on these critical efforts.

from Karalee Browne to everyone: 10:24 AM

Good Morning! Karalee Browne, Institute for Local Government. We are the statewide nonprofit affiliate of the League of California Cities, CSAC and CSDA. (Good to see you again, Monica!)

## **ESJ Action Plan Overview & Workshop Details**

from Deborah Kaplan to everyone: 10:27 AM

How can the captions be turned on?

from Haga, Joseph to everyone: 10:29 AM

Captioned stream: <http://www.adminmonitor.com/ca/cpuc>

from Abigail Solis to everyone: 11:01 AM

Thank you for your responses. I look forward to working on this topic!

from Marybel Batjer to everyone: 11:01 AM

Sorry everyone I must leave the workshop but will return this afternoon.

from Gwen Chang to everyone: 11:02 AM

Hi this is Gwen (she/her) from CEJA - will these slides be shared with us?

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 11:02 AM

Hi Gwen! Yes the slides will be made available after the workshop

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Gwen Chang to everyone: 11:02 AM  
Thank you!

## **Defining ESJ: Understanding Definitions and Terms for CPUC Programs and Policies**

from The Central Valley Urban Institute to everyone: 11:09 AM  
Eric Payne | Executive Director | The Central Valley Urban Institute

from Nathan to everyone: 11:22 AM  
Will the development of the framework or baseline definition process consider existing state policy definitions that exist but are not widely in use? For example, ICARP has an existing definition of climate vulnerability that has been sort of sidelined in other agency actions.

from Amee Raval to everyone: 11:27 AM  
Yes, part of that is because ICARP's definition is qualitative but provides a framework for a quantitative set of indicators and data visualization platform that OPR is soon to begin. They are also hiring for a associate planner to execute this work. More to come, but very exciting to make this concrete

from Nathan to everyone: 11:27 AM  
Thanks, Amee!

from Roberto Carlos Torres to everyone: 11:29 AM  
Hello, I am Roberto Carlos Torres, Climate Equity Specilaist for the City of San Diego. I need to hop off, but wanted to add that our communities can be very diverse and how we define our disadvantaged communities or communities of concern is very important. It can be hard for the state to capture these diverse definitions and names, so what is most important to addressing equity is ensuring they have their voices reflected in these definitions. It is good to have a baseline for the definitions, but some flexibility should be allowed for jurisdictions that have done their own work to define and understand communities of concern. Here in San Diego, we developed our Climate Equity Index to identify our Communities of Concern.

from Daniel Taillant to everyone: 11:33 AM  
Resend to Everyone: Hello everyone ... one comment on general approach and content ... The World is Changing, and our global and our federal policy, as well as CA State Policy is accelerating on Climate Change, Environmental Justice, Inclusivity and Social Equity. It would be great that the revision of the plan take into account these evolving changes ... I hope it will be possible to do so. For example, running the ESJ Action Plan through the recent Biden Executive Orders on Climate and Racial Equity, for example will be key. Daniel Taillant - Center for Human Rights and Environment CHRE/IGSD)

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



from Syche Cai to everyone: 11:35 AM

How do you envision the baseline definition that was mentioned earlier to be structured? Will it be a series of questions?

from Lupe Reyes to everyone: 11:36 AM

would you provide a list of the 95 actions items. thank you.

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 11:36 AM

Hi everyone, if you have given your comment, please click the hand icon again to lower your hand. Will help us keep track of who wants to speak. Thank you!

from Alice Sung to everyone: 11:37 AM

This has been a great conversation, and thanks to Amee GIS -spatial data based data sources that would be great to overlay in filters in a single compatible platform. some of these are from DOE, NREL, and include energy burdens by census tracts, etc. and it would be good to get standardized data for these indicators in formats from sources that can be imported and overlaid to visualize where PRIORITIES can lie.

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 11:37 AM

Hi Lupe here is the report:

[http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/uploadedFiles/CPUCWebsite/Content/UtilitiesIndustries/Energy/EnergyPrograms/Infrastructure/DC/Env%20and%20Social%20Justice%20ActionPlan\\_%202019-02-21.docx.pdf](http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/uploadedFiles/CPUCWebsite/Content/UtilitiesIndustries/Energy/EnergyPrograms/Infrastructure/DC/Env%20and%20Social%20Justice%20ActionPlan_%202019-02-21.docx.pdf)

from Kapil Kulkarni to everyone: 11:37 AM

Hi Lupe - action plan is here: <https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/esjactionplan/>

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 11:37 AM

Thanks Kapil !

from Lucas Duffy to everyone: 11:37 AM

In your efforts to develop baseline definitions, have you aggregated all the definitions relevant to ESJ that have already been used by the CPUC in formal proceedings?

from The Central Valley Urban Institute to everyone: 11:43 AM

I have my hand raised, but I'm not sure if my icon is highlighted

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 11:44 AM

Yes it is but we can make those changes ..someone has to break the mold

from Gwen Chang to everyone: 11:44 AM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



I want to uplift Amee's comment on lack of access to or knowing how to access technical assistance in programs is often a barrier to participation in DAC communities. That's something that I've seen through implementation of SOMAH, especially when conducting outreach to DACs that CEJA serves. I don't have a solution to this but want to uplift it from an implementation perspective.

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 11:45 AM  
yes

from Jack Peach to everyone: 11:47 AM  
I'd just like to second the questions posed by Syche and Lucas - Is it the intention of the CPUC to aggregate all definitions that have already been used by the CPUC in proceedings? What will that look like for staff? Will it be a series of questions to determine what definition should be used?

from Alice Sung to everyone: 11:47 AM  
How can we, the public listening in now but make comment in the future, and is there a timeline cutoff to submit comments? Sorry, I need to hop off this call.

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 11:48 AM  
H Alice - feel free to send thoughts to [ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov). No real cut off as far as deadline.

from Amee Raval to everyone: 11:50 AM  
^ Yes great example Gwen. I also think the Self-Generation Incentive Program (SGIP) and Community-Solar Green Tariff (CS-GT) are other program examples that APEN has engaged with and tried to apply to but the definitions are not the challenge for us as much as the technical barriers to know about and keep up with the program's timeline and then gather the materials and complete a successful application.

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 11:51 AM  
Rural communities have been heavily impacted during COVID as far as connectivity and cost of connectivity i.e. internet ..The cost of having internet and access to internet in these spaces has been even more of a burden to folks who already are challenged. What is being done Is this being considered...language thereof?

from Alice Sung to everyone: 11:54 AM  
^yes, +1 @ Amee and Gwen! So much improvement in how info is communicated and accessed as well as how programs are designed to avoid these unintended consequences around Who receives the funding. Thanks for the comment link. Looking forward to contonuing the conversation.

from Doug Karpa to everyone: 11:55 AM  
One point to consider is that there are many dimensions to justice considerations. Here in San Mateo Community, our air quality is reasonably good because of our geography, so CalEnviroScreen will fail to identify the justice

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



dimensions important to our communities. Therefore, San Mateo County has developed a Community Vulnerability Index focused on the particular challenges that face our communities. (Notice that housing costs is key in our index, for example). <https://cmo.smcgov.org/cvi>. I would encourage the Commission to develop and use a suite of different indices that draw on different data sources to identify different justice issues. I would point to some of the work in the affordability docket where CCAs have engaged to develop tools to identify economic stress as a good example of the development of tailored indices. (R.18-07-006)

from Tyler Earl to everyone: 11:58 AM

Really appreciate all the discussion so far, and really appreciate all the work you have done on this front Amee!! In the discussion around the actual term "disadvantaged communities", I think its important to recognize that euphemisms like this are used in state policy partially because of racist laws and attitudes like Proposition 209 that prohibit or discourage discussion of race in policymaking. There's so many socio-economic factors at play, but the term "environmental justice" was coined to speak to the specific environmental injustices faced by Black folks, even controlling for class. I think there's good work to try and address racial justice in these definitions without explicitly naming it, but the fact that it is still taboo to name and discuss race in these conversations is telling.

from Amee Raval to everyone: 11:59 AM

++ Tyler - thank you for grounding in that history we often don't make explicit in policy spaces

from Jennifer West to everyone: 11:59 AM

I want to second the comment by Doug Karpa, that within areas like the Bay Area there are smaller communities, and individuals who need support, even if the wider community shows on tools as having greater resources.

from The Central Valley Urban Institute to everyone: 12:00 PM

Let me affirm Tyler Earl comments

from SENAIT FORTHAL to everyone: 12:00 PM

Thank you all for creating this open public discussion. I would like to address a couple of issues I think are missing from the discussion today. One is that community outreach and education is always on the list goal but never gets the spotlight. If we are serious about addressing climate change issues, we have to have our impacted communities at the table. We need to educate the residents and get their input. Substantive Change can only happen from the bottoms, not the other way around. Second, is that we need to spend resources to educate CBO.

from Robert Perry to everyone: 12:02 PM

One usefule lens I would like offer is opportunity. California has very ambitious, wide-ranging goals and empowerment and investment in ESJ communities offers the greatest opportunities for advancement towards those objectives.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



## **BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Transportation & Rail**

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:00 PM  
Good Afternoon, Everyone

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:02 PM  
Will we have any commissioners or ALJs in this breakout? I want to be mindful of ex parte limitations

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:03 PM  
I plan to keep discussion very general anyway

from Palmeira, Monica to everyone: 1:03 PM  
Yes, that would be great thanks!

from Bond, Matthew to everyone: 1:09 PM  
ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov

from Palmeira, Monica to everyone: 1:11 PM  
Hi all - A reminder that the session is being recorded and will be made available at [www.cpuc.ca.gov/ESJActionPlan](http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/ESJActionPlan)

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:12 PM  
Any efforts underway to change the calculation for Cal. Sts. & Hys. §§ 190 (2454) to prioritize grade separations so that pedestrians are given more importance?

from Arnold San Miguel to everyone: 1:18 PM  
From a personal interest. Any discussion about allowing rubber tire vehicle on rail lines? eg. I have seen on internet small bus like vehicles that travel on both rail lines and on streets?

from Monica de la Cruz to everyone: 1:23 PM  
This is a crossover question for energy and transportation: what is being done to support the scaling of electric bus fleets for public transit? Could there be a new rate structure for charging? Any other incentive programs for local transit agencies?

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:25 PM  
Notice is statutory, ALJs very lenient in granting party status by oral motion- to my mind the issue is outreach at the outset,

from Paul A to everyone: 1:26 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



What steps are being taken to prioritize EV charging infrastructure siting/investment in "ESJ communities," especially in areas of high concentrations of folks who drive for TNCs? How are we tracking progress?

from Julia to everyone: 1:26 PM

It would be great if the Commission could review how federal agencies handle public input without creating barriers to participation. Anyone can submit comments on rules proposed for adoption by USDOT without any barrier to participation.

from Michael to everyone: 1:27 PM

Michael Pimentel, California Transit Association: I'd recommend that the CPUC hold more workshops, workgroups with stakeholders to read them into policy discussions that are evolving and to, as Monica, acknowledged, inform the comments that are considered in proceedings.

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:28 PM

You could require public notice at the site of the proposed project; amend G.O. 88-B to require public notice (those tend to be invisible to public),

from Erin McAuliff to everyone: 1:28 PM

Yes, I have been told by constituents they feel discouraged and do not want to spend time submitting informal comments if they are not going to be considered as part of the record. And they also do not have the bandwidth to officially participate as a party.

from Patrisha Pat Piras to everyone: 1:29 PM

Will the various "chats" that are being saved be posted so that people can follow them later?

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:31 PM

For EV transit fleets, SB-1 grants available under TIRCP (Transit & Intercity Rail Capital Program) program through CalSTA.

from Amar Cid to everyone: 1:33 PM

funds available as well from SB-1 State of Good Repair and Low Carbon Transit Ops Program for EV Transit and infrastructure

from Jessica Yarnall Loarie to everyone: 1:35 PM

Any plans for CPUC involvement in the electrification of the in-state locomotives in line with other state goals under SB 32/350? (possibly in collaboration with other agencies like CARB?) Any updates on the timing for the CPUC's clean miles standard proceeding?

from Palmeira, Monica to everyone: 1:35 PM

We had not intended to post chats but we could see what we could do! We are recording them for our purposes.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Monica de la Cruz to everyone: 1:36 PM  
Transit riders unions/associations

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:37 PM  
For Rail issues, I think you have to focus on transit agencies, municipalities, counties and state agencies because freights can argue federal preemption under ICCTA of 1995 if Copmission tries to compel any action

from Ito, Douglas to everyone: 1:39 PM  
Regarding Rail, CARB has a group working on freight rail issues, and has funded cleaner locomotives through grant programs in the past

from Monica de la Cruz to everyone: 1:39 PM  
Environmental Justice CBOs/CEJA

from Michael to everyone: 1:39 PM  
Please include California Transit Association in notices for rail-related proceedings. Contact is.

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:40 PM  
Carl Moyer grants have been used for passenger rail upgrades for Tier IV diesels

from Mason, Charles to everyone: 1:40 PM  
Welcome, Jose!

from Mark Gruberg to everyone: 1:43 PM  
TNCs are having a huge impact on both emissions and congestion. Electrification may improve emissions at some point down the road, but to what extent is not clear, and congestion will continue to be a major problem. A recent study by transporation consultant Bruce Schaller found that TNCs more than double vehicle miles traveled (VMT), and even pooled rides create more congestion. Will you consider limiting TNC numbers, at least in major cities, or giving cities some regulatory control over TNCs?

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:49 PM  
Commute time

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:49 PM  
Distance to services

from Mason, Charles to everyone: 1:50 PM

## Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Data Points to Consider - location of pick up locations overlayed with census data (race), also overlay with CalENVIRO Screen to see if there is consistency. Location of rail based homeless encampments, I know these move, but you could get data from social service agencies, fire, police, non-profits, etc.

from Priscilla Freduah-Agyemang to everyone: 1:50 PM

Displacement near bus and rail stations, homelessness and how to track them. Transit and rail plans that address displacement of communities new bus and rail

from Priscilla Freduah-Agyemang to everyone: 1:51 PM

Engagement with low-income communities about infrastructure needs - starting with cities and local stakeholders

from Patrisha Pat Piras to everyone: 1:55 PM

Why not try to find out who you're NOT hearing from ?!?!

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:55 PM

Some of our districts have found outreach in local community centers such as churches really helps because you can provide childcare for working parents.

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:56 PM

Yay, Mom!

from Jose Saldana CARB to everyone: 1:56 PM

Happy to share your EJ efforts on CARB EJ Blog: <https://carbej.blogspot.com/2021/01/carb-railyard-emissions-virtual.html>

from Jose Saldana CARB to everyone: 1:57 PM

its been serving as a ej community bulletin board of sorts

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



## **BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Telecommunications**

from Shaun Raval (Consultant) to everyone: 12:58 PM

Reminder: This session is being Recorded

from Ikle, Judith to everyone: 1:31 PM

For #3 Inmate Communication Services and new OIR that includes rates should be included in ESJ Plan going forward. No need for me to speak.

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:34 PM

There needs to be a targeted way to reach BIPOC communities on this issue, whether it be through a setaside, direct allocation, etc.

from Christine Mailloux to everyone: 1:38 PM

Agree on a board or panel to advise, recognizing work of the LIOB and other existing groups. There is some model through the public purpose program Administrative Committees that used to serve more of that role; and there was more funding for more direct community outreach and support that is third party/neutral marketing and outreach. Not leaving it to the carriers to do. This could be expanded beyond the formal programs

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:38 PM

In addition, the CPUC/providers must hear directly from residents about how lack of broadband goes beyond school aged children. Access to transportation, providing input to policies and programs, information, etc is becoming more dependent on broadband.

from Stan Santos to everyone: 1:38 PM

1) Service Providers upsell low-income access when the participant discovers it does not need their needs

from Stan Santos to everyone: 1:40 PM

2) When ATT offers a 6 Mbps internet (which is 90% of rural communities), you get "up to" 6 Mbps, under the best conditions, most of the time you get below.

from Stan Santos to everyone: 1:41 PM

3) the CPUC California Broadband Map uses some of the industry data, like above.

from Abigail Solis to everyone: 1:42 PM

I didn't know about that, Sarah. Can you provide a link?

from James Vergara to everyone: 1:43 PM

I would also like a link please

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



from Perez-Green, Joanna to everyone: 1:44 PM

<https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/General.aspx?id=2427>

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 1:44 PM

Employment ...testing sites... working from home...creating disparities ..even greater dissonance

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:45 PM

++Martha

from Perez-Green, Joanna to everyone: 1:45 PM

This link includes the LifeLine program "Universal Lifeline Telephone Service Trust Administrative Committee (ULTSAC)" which has multiple CBO openings which Sarah noted

from Hooman Hedayati to everyone: 1:45 PM

Some of you might be interested in NDIA/CWA's Oct 2020 report on AT&T's Digital Redlining

<https://www.digitalinclusion.org/blog/2020/10/05/just-released-atts-digital-redlining-leaving-communities-behind-for-profit/>

from Christine Mailloux to everyone: 1:46 PM

Must recognize that there is limited resources and funding for these groups to participate in things like the Admin Committee (even with expenses paid) and Consortia. Funding and stipends are important, plus a welcoming environment, bringing the information to the community and working on their turf, not expecting the community to come to the Commission. Also Admin Committee \*used\* to be very limiting, groups participating could not also participate in Commission grant funded projects, hopefully that has changed

from Jones, Caleb to everyone: 1:46 PM

There's 5 openings for CBOs on the LifeLine Administrative Committee -- 2 primaries and 3 alternates. If you're interested in joining, please email [Caleb.Jones@Cpuc.Ca.Gov](mailto:Caleb.Jones@Cpuc.Ca.Gov) and [Mary.Rottman@Cpuc.Ca.Gov](mailto:Mary.Rottman@Cpuc.Ca.Gov).

from Abigail Solis to everyone: 1:49 PM

The negative effects of not having access to broadband goes beyond school and work. Non-access causes a barrier to many of the programs offered by the IOU's, for example: Demand Response and TOU. Lack of internet is the just the gateway to many other barriers that follow because of it.

from Abigail Solis to everyone: 1:52 PM

Health and Safety factors need to be included in all CPUC's cost effectiveness test.

from Stan Santos to everyone: 1:55 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Thanks for putting up the CWA report

from Nat Treadway to everyone: 1:56 PM

Very welcome comments from Leslie Martinez. Thank you.

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 1:57 PM

Yes please...

from Stan Santos to everyone: 1:58 PM

Anybody wants to connect re Fresno County underserved communities and our Testing and Mapping Project, please contact me:

from Sarah Sharpe to everyone: 1:58 PM

i can be reached at [sarah.sharpe@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:sarah.sharpe@cpuc.ca.gov)

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 1:59 PM

Thank you good stuff

from Christine Mailloux to everyone: 2:00 PM

Thank you so much11

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



## **BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Wildfire Safety**

from Stephen St Marie to everyone: 1:05 PM  
Five minutes is WAY too long.

from Agatha Wein to everyone: 1:27 PM  
One idea is to create a communications dependence overlay. So this wouldn't be an additional independent use case, but fire threat + communications blackout threat might be useful to avoid loss of life in rural areas

from Agatha Wein to everyone: 1:27 PM  
^referencing evacuation / emergency communications during wildfire

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:35 PM  
The SGIP map doesn't take into account many vulnerable seniors and people with disabilities who live next to Tier 2 and 3 wildfire zones and were evacuated last year but can't access the SGIP funds for residential batteries. Also, as is being spoken to now is the fact that the Electric utilities aren't doing enough to include vulnerable senior and disability ratepayers into their Medical Baseline program so they are able to access the benefits of the SGIP program. And when I've asked for specific numbers of vulnerable seniors and people with disabilities have actually been able to access the SGIP residential battery funds, which presently appear to be \$0! No one at the CPUC has provided any details about those that have been served by the fund and when new funds will be available and how much will be made available

from Tomassian, Koko M. to everyone: 1:35 PM  
Written comments can be submitted to the following inbox: [ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov)

from Alexandra to everyone: 1:38 PM  
Where could I find out more info on the IBEW/community collages 18-24 month training program?

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:39 PM  
I was unable to access the promised captioning, which has been a typical problem with the Webex platform. Of course, the problem could be with my 77 year old mind, but real access to these events shouldn't be this difficult. I've not received a response as to whether the present CPUC ADA Coordinator has reviewed the agency's event "program" access to determine if modifications to the agency's public interaction is truly accessible. I also understand that the present ADA Coordinator has moved into a new position and is only doing minimal work as it relates to the ADA Coordinator position. That's very problematic

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:40 PM  
And last, as the beginning of the meeting "survey" showed, there are apparently only 3

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:41 PM

% of the participants today from community based organizations. I'm specifically concerned that there aren't more organizations representing vulnerable seniors and people with disabilities participating today.

from Shrayas Jatkar to everyone: 1:41 PM

shrayas.jatkar@cwdb.ca.gov

from Alexandra to everyone: 1:41 PM

Thank you Shrayas!

from Zach Lou to everyone: 1:41 PM

If interested in seeing more about workforce challenges and opportunities in veg management, see Chapter 11 of the AB 398 report "Putting California on the High Road: A Jobs and Climate Action Plan for 2030":

<https://cwdb.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/43/2020/09/AB-398-Report-Putting-California-on-the-High-Road-ADA-Final.pdf>

from Stephen St Marie to everyone: 1:42 PM

Would people please identify themselves and their affiliations?

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:43 PM

It took me thirty minutes to sign into this Cisco WebEx. This WebEx system is discriminatory to persons with disabilities.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:44 PM

I signed into Wildfire mitigation which has failed to address the needs of seniors and persons with disabilities. The contract for mitigation by PG&E and private utilities during electricity shutoffs is discriminatory towards vulnerable populations.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:45 PM

You are shutting out the wildfire survivors because Karen Duncanwood, a senior, who lost her house in Paradise wildfires cannot figure out how to testify at this hearing.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:46 PM

You lie about public participation hearings if you continue to use Cisco WebEx instead of Zoom for meetings and hearings

from Alan Talhelm CARB to everyone: 1:47 PM

CAL FIRE's Forest Health Program has provided recent grant funding to several forest management training programs at community colleges around California, at Shasta College, Reedley College, and Tahoe Community College.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:48 PM

When the Commissioners met to decide whether to give permission to the electric utilities they oversee, the four people representing people with disabilities and vulnerable seniors were allowed 1 minute to describe their concerns! That's pretty outrageous and clearly shows that the CPUC is less than interested in hearing from those communities even though those two communities have been the most threatened by the electric utility failure to protect ratepayers living in Tier 2=3 wildfire areas. And, again, the threat to vulnerable seniors and ratepayers with disabilities has not been mitigated, since the SGIP funds went to ratepayers with wells instead of those whose lives are specifically threatened by the electric utility de-energization events.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:49 PM

Contract that PG&E made with CFILC is deficient and people with disabilities cannot get residential backup batteries that can last and be recharged for the recipient across the state and not all ILC's are participating, and the SPIG program gave residential backup battery funding to businesses like those with expensive wells and not low-income disabled, seniors, and others. People face redtape and government paperwork without getting relief needed.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:50 PM

I'm tired of hearing the word "equity" because it is meaningless.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:51 PM

And, when is the CPUC going to act to protect vulnerable seniors and people with disabilities who live in multi-family housing who even if they would be successful in getting SGIP funds, aren't able to have the residential batteries installed because the property owner won't permit the installation. How is the CPUC going to mitigate the effects of electric utility de-energization effects on those individuals?

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:53 PM

Wildfire safety is more than a worker's needs. It is about safety for California residents which is not being told people have to pay upfront for batteries under the SGIP program, a door hanger on a disabled persons door, go to the hospital when your electricity is off, and people losing food, medicines, ingress and egress when electricity is shutoff.

from Alexandra to everyone: 1:54 PM

Can we please distinguish between poor rural forested areas and more wealthy WUI areas?

from Alexandra to everyone: 1:55 PM

We could therefore address economically equitability in our mitigation strategy

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:57 PM

That's the problem. We are now facing year three of CPUC approved electric utility de-energization events with no, yes NO REAL MITIGATION MADE AVAILABLE TO THOSE MOST THREATENED BY THE ACTION OF THE THREE ELECTRIC UTILITIES

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:57 PM

Karen Duncanwood wanted to comment, but this isn't a community input session, this is a discriminatory public meeting that denies access altogether!

from Agatha Wein to everyone: 1:57 PM

Thanks all!

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:57 PM

I don't see your email

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:58 PM

Please send me a copy of this chat!

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 1:58 PM

And, what is happening with the CPUC's efforts to assure all telephonic utilities are putting generators at their cell towers so when the electric utilities turn off power to their grid, our cell phone will continue to work so we can call emergency services if necessary or family, friends or neighbors if we need immediate help?

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:59 PM

CPUC is a regular denier of public input

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:59 PM

Agree with commenter above about microgrids

## **Systematizing ESJ Considerations: Incorporating ESJ Issues in to CPUC Proceedings and Processes**

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 2:03 PM

It wasn't made clear that we could use original link to get back in

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:04 PM

Gee, this is great! I'm the only community organization participant? And, where's the captioning and sign language? I am unable to find any info about how to access those services on this platform. Why isn't the CPUC ADA Coordinator participating today?

from Sara Moore to everyone: 2:05 PM

You can access a captioned stream here <http://www.adminmonitor.com/ca/cpuc/workshop/20210203/cc/>

from Sara Moore to everyone: 2:06 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



You have to click on "Click Here for Live Closed Caption"

from Allison Brown to everyone: 2:06 PM

Thanks Sara!

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:10 PM

I tried that and ended up getting multiple screens and voices speaking. I tried to access the captioning but apparently, because I'm not an IT expert, wasn't able to get the captioning. Access to your public meeting events can not be this difficult. This is unacceptable, especially since the issue being discussed relate to the threat to the lives of a very large number of vulnerable seniors and people with disabilities.

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:13 PM

@Richard, once you have the other webpage up I think you have to close this one so you don't get the voice duplication. Hover over the video feed and you'll see a largely white box in the bottom right corner. Click and select the language you're interested in and the captions appear after a second or two.

from claudia sanchez to everyone: 2:13 PM

Mr. Skaff - you may be hearing multiple voices because/you may be listening to it via WebEx and adminmonitor. it is recommended you only stream through one of the options. there is also a slightly delay between the WebEx and Adminmontior streams

from Matthew George to everyone: 2:13 PM

I would try turning the volume off on the adminmonitor feed and only use it for the live closed caption to eliminate multiple audio feeds. But I'm no IT expert either.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:14 PM

Up to now, vulnerable seniors and people with disabilities concerns about the threats from electric utility de-energization haven't been listend to. When the previous Executive Director attempted to respond to those threats by getting the Commission to put funds into the SGIP residential battery program, the money went to other, more technically proficient The promised funds and batteries continue to be inaccessible to the State's most vulnerable. And now, even though one electric utility, PGE, has at leas one thousand Medical Baseline ratepayer waiting to get those batteries, the Commission has yet to provide new funds.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:16 PM

And then, the CPUC has events like those taking place today with a system, Webex, that has substantial accessibility "problems". That's why most other public agencies are using platforms like Zoom (I'm not saying that Zoom should be used, but suggesting that the Commission must find a more accessible way to hold these events!

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:20 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Where is the analysis of the SGIP residential battery program to see whether that program has responded to the needs of the most affected electric utility ratepayers?

from Sarah Salem to everyone: 2:22 PM

I think scoping isn't just a moment but a continuous effort - ensuring communities are part of the process - not based on how the CPUC traditionally gets input but meeting people where they are at. ie - door knocking - and support both large and small community based organizations. and making sure we aren't disproportionately asking the same people with no deep support - ie money as other stakeholders often get

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:22 PM

Thank you Leadership Council for that comment. Apologies for my own ignorance here, but how does the CPUC engage California native peoples and tribal governments to engage and ensure meaningful involvement?

from Christine Mailloux to everyone: 2:24 PM

TURN is working with a group of organizations in the incarcerated calling docket and have worked with other organizations in the disconnections docket, and as we educate these groups about intervenor compensation, party status, ex parte rules, filing comments, service lists, etc. we realize how difficult the process is to navigate directly if you don't do it regularly

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:24 PM

Will the site show the "Raised Hand" option? Or are public participants not going to be allowed to speak?

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:26 PM

@Richard, click "participants" in bottom right corner. There's a small hand at the bottom of the participants list.

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:26 PM

Thank you Nicole!

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:28 PM

This is a "copy and paste" of an email I received from a California ratepayer with disabilities:

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:28 PM

Ex is terrible and discriminates against persons with disabilities in participating in these breakout sessions as ten minutes and I'm still trying to connect, but it simply says "Starting Your Meeting" and thereby is discriminating against those with disabilities who are unable to sign on, have easy access meeting access and opportunity to participate.

Please accept this email as an official complaint in violation of my ADA and civil rights under federal and state access laws and regulations.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



I am thoroughly disgusted and cannot sit here without being able to fairly participate. This is deliberate since the firing of Alice Stebbins as Executive Director of the CPUC as the Commissioners want to deliberately deny participation by communities that the ESJ Plan was supposed to include, but apparently it is another hollow document of nice meaningless words!

Respectfully,

Connie Arnold

Disability Rights Advocate 30+ Years

from Lara Ettenson to everyone: 2:29 PM

Hi All - It is not just your organization that has substantial delays with Icomp. If folks want to engage on Icomp improvements, please reach out to me: Lara Ettenson

from James Birkelund (SBUA) to everyone: 2:34 PM

Hi - James Birkelund from Small Business Utility Advocates. My microphone would not unmute. Would it make sense for the Commission to consider a placeholder in ALL Scoping Memos for "Environmental Justice"? Most dockets have some relevant impacts. Parties could be invited in every docket to comment on that topic. Thank you.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:34 PM

Why am I not able to see all participants? Right now, I am unable to see who is speaking. I don't see her name on the list

from Sarah Salem to everyone: 2:35 PM

exactly

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:35 PM

@Richard, general public participants can only see the name of panelists rather than everyone in attendance.

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:36 PM

I agree with Leslie - can the CPUC offer a regularly scheduled "intro to advocacy & participation" to dispel the confusion about engaging efficiently through existing venues, navigate the webpage, and answer related common questions like Icomp?

from Gwen Chang to everyone: 2:36 PM

I think that Leslie's comment on capacity from lawyers who have knowledge of CPUC as a limiting factor is absolutely correct. We are always looking for ways to build that capacity within our advocacy spaces but often run up against this issue.

from Christine Mailloux to everyone: 2:37 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Even the NOI process is rough, especially with specific requirements around the organization's bylaws and Articles of Incorporation, barriers with other outside funding, etc. Understand that there must be rules and standards/structure for this program, but some barriers could be loosened and made more flexible in certain circumstances

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:37 PM

Well, I don't see anyone else in the Participant list other than myself

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:37 PM

Pardon me, that should have been, I don't see anyone on the Attendee list except me.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:38 PM

Why are they "masked"?

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:39 PM

If they are able to speak and are public attendees, why can't their name and organization be shown? Is that a privacy requirement?

from Christine Mailloux to everyone: 2:39 PM

Hopefully, as you Scope these proceedings with more of a focus on ESJ issues, it will be easier to do outreach more directly to appeal to the issues that communities care about. We've all sat in PPHs with only two or three people in attendance. Ways of framing the issue to appeal to specific issues and social justice terms, will help with outreach I hope

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:41 PM

User privacy? If this is a public event, why is that an issue? If someone is speaking here, as a participant, we need to know who they are and who they represent and that should be part of their testimony.

from claudia sanchez to everyone: 2:43 PM

@Richard no one has been sworn in under oath. There is no "testimony" going on today. It is all public comment.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 2:43 PM

And please respond to me and everyone on this issue.

from Martita Armas to everyone: 2:43 PM

Yes good point

from claudia sanchez to everyone: 2:44 PM

if you are not speaking please mute

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:44 PM

To echo Claudia's point, just as folks in a regular in-person meeting attend and even provide public comment without naming their org, I think the same rules apply here.

from Martita Armas to everyone: 2:45 PM

so sorry

from Sarah Salem to everyone: 2:47 PM

and how they impact us

from Sophie Babka to everyone: 2:47 PM

On the topic of docket, it would be extremely useful if all comments filed in a proceeding were stored in the docket/or stored somewhere publically.

from Gwen Chang to everyone: 2:48 PM

To Deborah's comment - I absolutely agree that the systems and information is incredibly hard to find on the website. I have been trained by folks within CEJA and also Charles at the CPUC but it is by no means intuitive.

from Lara Ettenson to everyone: 2:49 PM

I agree with having participants listed for future events. One of the values of these meetings is to connect the stakeholders who are interested in these issues.

from Srinidhi Sampath-Kumar to everyone: 2:49 PM

100% agree with Debra! Every step of the process from being a party to the proceeding to applying for Icomp is hard. I do find CEC's comment process a little bit more straightforward but it is by no means the best. Thank you

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 2:50 PM

State water board and prop 1 @nicole

from claudia sanchez to everyone: 2:51 PM

@SophieBabka the CPUC began allowing public comment to be posted for proceedings on each proceedings Docket Card. There are some character limitations to that but we encourage all members of the public to submit comments for specific proceedings via the Docket Card for that specific proceeding

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



**Thursday February 4, 2021**

## **Commissioner Welcome, Thanks, and Summary of Day 1**

from J. Daniel Taillant to everyone: 10:01 AM  
Good morning everyone ...

from arthur Fisher to everyone: 10:03 AM  
test

from Oscar Flores to everyone: 10:04 AM  
Good morning from the City of Lynwood

from arthur Fisher to everyone: 10:11 AM  
can we switch to slide ?

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 10:21 AM  
will all participants be shown on the Webex list of participants? If not, why not? Having participants listed who are involved in a public meeting isn't a HIPA issue and I know of no other privacy regulation requiring that names of participants not be shown.

from Mark Toney to everyone: 10:25 AM  
I concur with Richard Skaff that it is a best practice to list names of participants.

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 10:25 AM  
Hi Richard - I am looking into your question. Will respond when I have more information.

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 10:29 AM  
Hi Richard. Those attendees that make a comment verbally or in chat are identified, but much like in a non-virtual public meeting, those that do not are not listed. This is a feature of the Web Ex Event platform we are using. For the Breakout sessions in Web Ex Meeting, you will be able to see all participants.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



## Tracking and Measuring: Data Collection to Better Understand CPUC Impact in ESJ Communities

from Will Abrams to everyone: 10:35 AM

How will the data collected from the public be leveraged as a counterbalance to those views expressed by the utilities, their investors and other special interest stakeholders that have greater resources to effect the outcomes of proceedings? How will the data collected by the CPUC address the economic disparity between the resources applied by privately funded interests and those from the public to ensure public interests have a greater voice through commission decisions?

from Sarah Salem to everyone: 10:37 AM

a person centered approach to data collection specifically when thinking about community should require that people are being equitably compensated for collecting and contributing data collection - both qualitative and quantitative data

from Judith Ikle to everyone: 10:41 AM

Thanks Kathleen, Ian and Jamario - Great session on a critical issue. I am wondering if you have any examples of examinations of historical data at the Commission and conducting analysis on that. Understandably most of our data efforts are forward looking.

from Pete Woiwode to everyone: 10:42 AM

The PSPS's have had horrific effects on medically vulnerable communities- and have been implemented with little regard to the impacts on people with breathing machines, electric wheelchairs, etc. What is the CPUC doing to ensure that people are not denied their #PowerToLive?

from Pat Piras to everyone: 10:47 AM

Maybe I missed it, but I haven't heard anyone mention Privacy for individuals!

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 10:48 AM

Asset maps

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 10:49 AM

Statewide where we can see the visual of these disparities

from James Birkelund (SBUA) to everyone: 10:49 AM

Comment from Small Business Utility Advocates (James Birkelund). Great discussion. Is the PUC considering how an updated ESJ Action Plan might address the importance of small businesses in ESJ communities?

A substantial number of minority-owned small businesses are located in and employ residents of ESJ communities. Therefore, from our perspective, a robust ESJ Action Plan should specifically target and consider small businesses within ESJ communities with regard to data collection, ME&O, and otherwise.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



An Action Plan that identifies and emphasizes the importance of collecting data on small businesses in ESJ communities is important for understanding GHG and utility impacts on and promoting IOU program benefits for those communities. Doing so will help protect diverse small businesses and promote contract opportunities for them in ESJ communities.

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 10:50 AM

Anonymously we just need to see but we should compensate ...we want the info we need to treat folks equitably

from Steve Campbell to everyone: 10:53 AM

Hi Jamario. You just identified a critically important time and resource saving opportunity. Example: is it possible for the three IOU data sets to be standardized down to the column/row? The disconnections data is a good example of this. Each IOU reports the same data, but the organization of the data, across multiple tabs, is very different (different cells). This creates a huge time investment to clean and synthesize into useable information.

from Deidre Sanders to everyone: 10:53 AM

The CEC gives EPIC grants to academic institutions for data-driven research, but it often isn't accessible or useful for customers (per Jamario, the way the questions are framed and for what purpose?). Is the CPUC considering developing funding to bridge the data, per Ian, between "systems" and aggregate customers and communities?

from Srinidhi Sampath-Kumar to everyone: 11:00 AM

Some of the current data and metrics don't serve ESJ communities. Metrics like cost-effectiveness sometimes are more disruptive for programs that serve lower income, ESJ communities. A narrow focus on emissions reductions could also be a disservice to these communities and may paint a picture that is far from the reality on a program's effectiveness. A comprehensive data collection model that centers on the people and the intersectionality of the myriad issues that they face is needed. There is a need to go beyond energy savings and GHG emissions reductions to tracking other burdens and benefits (E.g. NEBs)

from Anna Solorio to everyone: 11:03 AM

Thank you Srinidhi, narrow focus on strict energy savings with out regard for health and safety does not serve ESJ communities, a more wholistic approach is a better measure to evaluate energy such as the ESA program.

from Tad Gondai to everyone: 11:06 AM

Tad Gondai with National Diversity Coalition. I agree that the utilities are collecting data to support their system focused interest. Public interest advocates need data that supports a person focused interest. The PUC should be collecting information with the intent to gather data that will measure and inform positions that support arguments in favor of people/ratepayer.

Yes, data itself should be "neutral" in that it is simply information, and it is the job of advocates to synthesize it into the most compelling arguments. But the fact remains that in proceedings, IOUs are gathering and select data with

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



their specific agendas in mind. The CPUC should be intentional about gathering data that supports ratepayers, and can discuss what that data should be.

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 11:06 AM

++ Srinidhi. the current models refuse to acknowledge and give value to the experiences of community. Also, this is the current model that continues to fail BIPOC communities

from Jennifer Capitolo to everyone: 11:06 AM

For the water utilities, there has been increased interest by the CPUC to encourage water utilities to offer customer assistance programs to renters. Most of the time, renters are not customers of water utilities, the landlords are the customers. Utilities have no relationship with renters. How does the panel envision a utility (or the Commission) collecting non-customer data to offer a customer assistance program? How does the utility (or the Commission) work through privacy issues?

from Mark Toney to everyone: 11:06 AM

TURN supports CPUC requiring IOUs to standardize utility shutoff data. It has been a nightmare to compare data submitted in different formats, some in Excel and other in PDF format.

from Kathryn woodford to everyone: 11:08 AM

Data gathering needs to be an in-person gathering. Standardized data gathering leaves out the many variables that people often face.

from Lauren Cunningham to everyone: 11:08 AM

I like Jamario's point about starting with smaller areas. It forces data collection to be tailored to areas that need the most attention

from Nat Treadway to everyone: 11:08 AM

Disparities and inconsistencies in the reporting disconnection data is a huge national issue. California at least has reporting! Some states do not. This issue is important for many reasons and at many levels.

from Mad Stano to everyone: 11:10 AM

One additional barrier for ESJ related data collection and application of that data at the Commission that I've observed is lack of knowledge on how to measure a particular equity or ESJ metric is used to justify refusing or indefinitely delaying measuring ESJ metrics. Like non-energy benefits. Compensated partnerships with community based organizations in ESJ communities can help with the how to measure and further identification of meaningful ESJ metrics led directly by community input.

from Nathan Bengtsson to everyone: 11:16 AM

I'd like to humbly and respectfully offer a comment from the perspective of a utility employee who is asking a number of data-informed questions about climate resilience, I just want to say that Jamario's point about keeping the end in

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



mind is critical. If a program needs to optimize for multiple policy outcomes, those outcomes need to be explicitly defined otherwise we wander into an undefined zone in which it is very difficult to understand if an intervention was effective, because regardless of the data gathered it is unclear what success means.

from Sarah Salem to everyone: 11:20 AM  
yes agree with this speaker

from Srinidhi Sampath-Kumar to everyone: 11:21 AM  
YES!! Fully agree with the speaker and this came up yesterday as well. Community should be treated as consultants.

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 11:22 AM  
CPUC/IOUs treat community like numbers, not people!!!

from Pete Woiwode to everyone: 11:22 AM  
Absolutely- we need clear representations of the impacts of PG&E and the IOU's actions on folks!

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:22 AM  
This morning at 11:30am, when the public comment section opens, I would ask that the following questions be responded to:

from Anna Solorio to everyone: 11:25 AM  
Long standing issue of the CPUC studies that pay consultants over \$200K for studies and pay Community Based Organizations \$50 dollars to collect the data for them.

from Lupe Reyes to everyone: 11:28 AM  
company's should be held accountable went they damage home's electronics.

from Tad Gondai to everyone: 11:28 AM  
Lot of good discussion and concerns have been brought up. I see most issues falling into the following framework:

- 1) Intent – gathering data with the purpose of focusing on people’s needs for affordability, reliability, equity, etc.
- 2) Data – identifying the specific type of data that we need to advocate public interest matters. How to gather this data, including compensating CBOs and individuals who provide it.
- 3) Accessibility – how to organize the data so it can be located and make the data understandable.

from Sarah Salem to everyone: 11:29 AM  
compensating community

from Nat Treadway to everyone: 11:29 AM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



While the focus on data is important, many public policy decisions require judgments that do not require quantitative data. Qualitative information about consumer preferences is powerful. Survey data avoids privacy issues. Survey can be conducted in marginalized communities. Has the CPUC experimented with Deliberative Democracy / Deliberative Polling (<https://cdd.stanford.edu/>) to get at the root of consumer preferences? When that research was based at the Univ. of Texas at Austin (1990s), the PUC of Texas required eight utilities to conduct Deliberative Polls on IRP. Soon thereafter, Texas left its old biases behind and embraced renewable resources.

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 11:29 AM

thank you...mindfulness we can do this but let's be true to our platform if that's really what we are trying to achieve

## **Public Comment Session**

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:32 AM

this is the same problem I had yesterday

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:32 AM

I will type in my questions

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:35 AM

1. I filed a Public Records Act request some time ago which was finally responded to but didn't answer my questions. I asked for the specific number of vulnerable seniors and people with disabilities who have received SGIP funds for residential batteries. I received an Excel spreadsheet with two pie charts that didn't have the requested details.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:36 AM

2. I am not presently required, with the CPUC now require that the electric utilities they oversee must all have a Medical Baseline program?

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:37 AM

3. If it's not presently requiring that all electric utilities it oversees provide the number of vulnerable senior/disabled ratepayers they serve and how many of those ratepayers they serve have received SGIP funds for residential batteries, will the Commission now require that data?

from Julia Prochnik to everyone: 11:38 AM

Thank you all very much for hosting this discussion and for the education. We have work to do to be more inclusive and appreciate these initial steps. Will there be community lead forums with CPUC to discuss programs, pilots and demos for communities looking for new clean energy options? thank you!

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:38 AM

4. When will new funds be added to the SGIP residential battery program and how much can we expect to be added to the program?

from Julia Prochnik to everyone: 11:39 AM

Also, please check out the website [justandequitable.org](http://justandequitable.org) for transition examples from other states. Thank you again!!!

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:40 AM

5. What is the CPUC presently doing to assure that during CPUC-approved electric utility de-energization events, cell service utilities like ATT and Verizon have backup power sources at ALL of their cell towers affected by electric utility de-energization events?

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:46 AM

6. The comments we regularly receive from those affected by the electric utility de-energization events continue to indicate that the electric utilities continue to fail to meet the present requirements set by the Commission for de-energization events. The latest letter from ATT to the Commission about the December Southern California Edison event in December of 2020 once again describes that continuing failure. And we see those failures with each of the electric utilities overseen by the Commission. We are now about to go into the third year of wildfire season with the CPUC approved electric utility de-energization program in place. What actions does the CPUC plan to put into place to assure that the electric utilities meet all CPUC de-energization requirements?

from HolLynn D'Lil to everyone: 11:46 AM

This is outrageous! I can't be seen or heard. It's par with the way PUC treats people with disabilities. The email received from Alison was totally inadequate with instructions on how to use this esoteric program. May I speak?  
HolLynn D'Lil

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 11:47 AM

HolLynn - We will make sure you can speak.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:49 AM

7. Apparently the present ADA Coordinator has taken a new position within the CPUC and is no longer working full time as the agency ADA Coordinator. When can we expect that very important and required position to be posted? And, the second ADA Coordinator position that was created last year was never filled. When will that position be posted for applications?

from Phinneas Gage to everyone: 11:56 AM

That comment seems outside the scope of this session

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Phinneas Gage to everyone: 11:56 AM  
THAT DOES NOT PROMOTE DISCUSSION ON THE esj PLAN

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 11:56 AM  
On electricity related engagements, I'd encourage people to check out "The Power of Power: Democratizing California's Energy Economy to Align with Environmental Justice Principles through Community Choice Aggregation" which lays out how CCAs are natural allies to EJSJ communities: <https://lawcat.berkeley.edu/record/1185874?ln=en>

from Phinneas Gage to everyone: 11:58 AM  
Specific proceedings/issues action plans are not germane to a discussion of revisions to the CPUC ESJ plan. Same for HR/staffing.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 11:59 AM  
Will the CPUC be requiring the electric utilities to create micro-grids similar to the system being created by other electric utilities around the Country.

from Pete Woiwode to everyone: 12:00 PM  
And lack of Access! People have had ENORMOUS trouble accessing this space and other CPUC events.

from HolLynn D'Lil to everyone: 12:01 PM  
I went to participant list, and was told I could not unmute myself.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 12:04 PM  
And by the way, as one of the presentors stated earlier in the meeting, "You cannot fix what we cannot measure". The electric utilities MUST provide the data to the CPUC so you can use that data to determine needed policy/rule additions and modifications.

from HolLynn D'Lil to everyone: 12:07 PM  
I've been working since 11:30 to join. I can see a box with my name on it, but no way to be seen. There is no way to raise my hand and no hand icon anywhere to indicate I would like to speak. Walter Park and Richard Skaff will have to represent me. But, just in case you look at this chat, you need to contact me so that I may tell you about the immense danger you are putting people with disabilities in, and the way you shut us out when we try to talk with you - you fired the only executive director who ever considered us, and you have yet to replace someone in the vacant ADA Coordinator position. Your success in shutting us out today is outstanding. I know there are many people who have tried to participate but, like me, are unable to navigate this esoteric meeting program. Why not use Zoom or Go To Meeting, well tried and successful programs? Why are you using this program which is faulty to a high degree. You have shut us out again.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 12:16 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



It's quite interesting. President Batjer apparently has left the Workshop! That shows how much interest she has in our concerns!

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 12:17 PM

Oops, Sorry. I see Ms. Batjer is actually here. Please accept my apology

from Marybel Batjer to everyone: 12:17 PM

I have NOT left.

from Richard Skaff to everyone: 12:18 PM

I just apologized, Ms. Batjer

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 12:21 PM

ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov

## **BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Energy**

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:06 PM

Amy your volume drops when you speak

from Jennifer West to everyone: 1:06 PM

Not for me... Amy sounds fine here.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:07 PM

Amy E. Mes... drops when you are speaking

from Hawkins, Nora to everyone: 1:07 PM

You can submit more detailed written comments or provide questions by emailing ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov

from Hawkins, Nora to everyone: 1:08 PM

If you would like to ask a question or make a comment, please use the raise hand feature.

from Hawkins, Nora to everyone: 1:08 PM

You will see the raise hand option next to your name in the participants list.

from Erica Petrofsky to everyone: 1:10 PM

To see the raise hand option, use your mouse to hover over your name in the participants list.

from Julia to everyone: 1:14 PM

I'm not sure I understand the prompt

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:14 PM  
can you repeat the question?

from Abigail Solis to everyone: 1:15 PM  
Outcomes should be specific and measurable. The current language is vague in this area.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:16 PM  
You need to start using Zoom for ease of use to allow ESJ participants better access. The Cisco WebEx is too difficult to connect to to provide meaningful access!

from Julia to everyone: 1:16 PM  
Agreed @JenniferWest

from Julia to everyone: 1:16 PM  
Are those outreach budgets sufficient

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:17 PM  
Persons with disabilities are also one of the largest minority groups and communities! Furthermore, persons with disabilities and seniors often don't have access to technology like computers!

from Jennifer West to everyone: 1:18 PM  
Sorry that I didn't identify myself - Jennifer West, StopWaste in Alameda County.

from Srinidhi Sampath Kumar to everyone: 1:18 PM  
+1 Leslie

from Julia to everyone: 1:18 PM  
YES, Leslie!

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:19 PM  
Access to ASL for these meetings should be added to these webcasts

from Julia Pyper to everyone: 1:19 PM  
Are there active programs to attach job training and small business development to the deployment of clean technologies? How can we couple low carbon solutions with wealth creation opportunities?

from Julia to everyone: 1:19 PM  
1) Pay CBOs well to do this challenging outreach, and 2) Reduce all the barriers to participation

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:20 PM

Also, real time captioning and transcripts should be available to provide access to ESJ communities

from Nenetzin Rodriguez to everyone: 1:20 PM

Completed agree with Leslie!

from Julia to everyone: 1:21 PM

Leslie said everything I'd want to share;

from Darshan to everyone: 1:22 PM

It is important that any organization seeking "input and participation" should also be clear with themselves about the extent to which they are willing to incorporate the input that communities give them. That can uncover the assumptions and power disparities that can hopefully lead to better outreach and engagement

from Ben Cooper to everyone: 1:22 PM

I whole-heartedly agree with Leslie and Jennifer. Also, NEED TO EXPAND CBO INVOLVEMENT TO PROGRAM DESIGN AND EVAL

from Julia to everyone: 1:23 PM

VALUE the work and expertise of CBOs the same way you value the for-profit implementers

from Darshan to everyone: 1:23 PM

^^agreed

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:23 PM

++ Martha. Consultants are valued more than the expertise of community and CBOs.

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:23 PM

++Julia

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:24 PM

also, an assumptions that CBOs that "should" do work for free

from Julia to everyone: 1:25 PM

++Leslie - or that consultants can just put them on our their RFP to get the contract

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:25 PM

+++Abigail

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 1:25 PM

Leslie totally agree lideres campesinos...or local small groups can do the work and should be compensated ..give back the value to the folks who are stepping up as leaders

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:26 PM

Customers are not listened to and not acted like they are not the experts of there own needs on what is needed, how about asking them???? What a concept!

from Jennifer West to everyone: 1:26 PM

We cannot hold outreach to DACs, etc and equitable programs to the cost-effectiveness thresholds that are currently in place.

from Julia to everyone: 1:26 PM

And ESA should not be the only program or offering we talk about for households with low incomes

from Larsen, John to everyone: 1:26 PM

This is especially true considering that a lot of renewable energy needs to or is best developed on the consumer side of the meter.

from Nenetzin Rodriguez to everyone: 1:27 PM

YES! Education is key! How can we put this education in our public schooling curriculum.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:27 PM

Material must be printed in different languages of an on-call interpreter to answer questions

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:27 PM

in the person's language

from sgersen to everyone: 1:27 PM

At minimum, why can't these programs operate outside the hours outside 9-5 Monday-Friday?

from Nenetzin Rodriguez to everyone: 1:27 PM

Language barrier is also a factor to. if we going to create educational materials...it needs to be in the different languages

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:27 PM

cost-effectivness strategies continue to reinforce racist policies and barriers to access

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:28 PM

Think of your customer as the expert of their life and as ratepayers who are not happy with rising costs!

from Julia to everyone: 1:28 PM

+1 Leslie re: cost-effectiveness!!

from Monica de la Cruz to everyone: 1:29 PM

we rely on IOUs to do a lot of the outreach, but as was mentioned, they are numbers driven and they often conduct outreach through traditional power structures like volunteer town councils, which aren't representative of the community

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:30 PM

Unless the infrastructure of changing technology like electric cars puts charging infrastructure in apartments and housing that is also accessible for persons with disabilities who drive cars or electric vans, it isn't accessible

from Julia to everyone: 1:30 PM

Cost-effectiveness is the enemy of equity as currently structured. It forces implementers to compete based on lowest cost (ie, lowest wages and lowest quality); ignores non-energy benefits; and insufficiently funds outreach to ESJ communities

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:30 PM

to minority communities

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:30 PM

cost-effectiveness is insulting to community who are ratepayers, and have been wronged by agencies and IOUs. The programs are not gifts to residents, its access to a basic resource. IOUs need to stop approaching programs for DACs as bare minimum, why are they not focused on health and climate resiliency

from Abigail Solis to everyone: 1:31 PM

Excellent point Senait! We need Better coordination between programs

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:32 PM

Because also seniors and persons with disabilities are lower income who are also subject to Medi-Cal spenddown to access long-term services and supports like needed help with caregiving expenses.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:33 PM

Just like access to vaccines, these minority communities do not know how or where to get an appointment to get the vaccine

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



from Monica de la Cruz to everyone: 1:33 PM

The more programs collaborate, the more resources can be offered as a "one stop shop." Rather than competing for attention and asking residents to get to know each program individually, we should collaborate on MEO

from Mad Stano to everyone: 1:34 PM

Total agree with comments offered and with Leslie and others on cost effectiveness. These tests fail to meaningfully incorporate non-energy benefits like pollution reduction, health improvements, affordability, quality of service, workforce development etc. These cost effectiveness tests are dehumanizing and exclude community impacts and interests. This inadequate analysis leads to inequitable outcomes and delays our energy transition + implementation of decarbonization goals.

from sarahzsalem to everyone: 1:34 PM  
access clean california

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:34 PM

Ask those ESJ communities what their needs are, also like SGIP, don't allow wealthy to access millions of dollars to empty out program funds that were meant for low-income populations

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:35 PM  
Right Martha, look at foundation

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:35 PM  
++Martha!

from Julia to everyone: 1:36 PM  
+1 @Mad

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:36 PM  
Martha is a family care provider opening mail for her mom to help her and sees the mail scams her family member gets

from Allan Rago to everyone: 1:37 PM  
ESA income guidelines for qualification do not align with the definition of disadvantaged communities. Perhaps those income guidelines (and all programs directed to lower income communities) could be better aligned.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:37 PM  
And also all of the robo calls that seniors and people with disabilities fall victim too!

from Leslie Martinez to everyone: 1:37 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



## YES MAD

from Katie Ramsey Sierra Club to everyone: 1:37 PM

Agree with Martha's statement on easy screening. One option to avoid overburdening communities is to make it very easy and straightforward to determine which programs a customer may be eligible. For example, a single online quiz that could produce a list of which energy programs a customer is eligible for.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:38 PM

Use county 211 and 311 for a screening tool

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:39 PM

for programs that low-income seniors and persons with disabilities might need help with. Programs reliant on contractors need to insure those contractors are doing good work and not ripping people off

from Peach, Jack to everyone: 1:40 PM

I previously worked for a clean energy industry body in Australia that provided an "Accredited Solar Installer" program that allowed consumers to find installers that met industry standards and assured customers that the provider that were using was a legitimate installer. Perhaps the CPUC could partner with non-profits/industry bodies to develop a similar tool that would allow consumers to ensure that providers were legitimate and could be trusted.  
<https://www.cleanenergycouncil.org.au/consumers/buying-solar/find-an-installer>

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:41 PM

For instance, free phones, energy discount programs, residential backup battery programs like SGIP for electric utility cutoff, UBER and Lyft lack of access by wheelchairusers and persons with disabilities

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:41 PM

airport services

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:41 PM

transit services

from Abigail Solis to everyone: 1:41 PM

+111@Mad

from Julia to everyone: 1:41 PM

+1 @Mad

from Martha Armas-Kelly to everyone: 1:42 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Please keep me in the loop on further meetings or disclosures... Really enjoyed your comments last two days Leslie ...as Always Leadership Council ...Have a blessed week everyone and keep the faith..WE can do this!!

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:43 PM

You can take a group of professional to a low-income housing site, and if a resident of housing comes up to a professional, that professional won't treat that resident in the same manner except if that resident comes dressed in a suit and then everyone wants to know who they are!

from nicole to everyone: 1:43 PM

It seems like access and qualifications for programs need to be looked at more. If we are not allowing customers in need to qualify for programs based on outdated guidelines than we can't provide access or assistance to those in need

from Allan Rago to everyone: 1:45 PM

Also, these programs, such as ESA, should provide the same services to renters as they do to home owners. Currently that's not the case.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:45 PM

This energy breakout session was it not to accept comments from the community or just agency members of this committee talking to themselves without consumer or public input????

from nicole to everyone: 1:46 PM

I agree allan, especially since the population in need are more than likely not to be home owners

from LaBonte, Alison to everyone: 1:46 PM

Connie. I'd like to hear from you.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:46 PM

Many seniors and persons with disabilities were victims in the PG&E and electric utility wildfires

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:47 PM

Microgrid are very important to keep the power on

from Alice to everyone: 1:47 PM

Thanks for the discussion about the "cost-effectiveness" test and its grave shortcomings. Not only does it take into account the valuation of non-energy benefits and other important metrics,; moreover, it has been designed to be cost effective (aka protects the bottom line interests of the utility) from the point of view of "cost effective FOR the utility, NOT the individual ratepayer, let alone Equitable. So a litmus test might be to ask, "cost effective" for "WHOM?" Cost effectiveness should not be manipulated to protect the profits of IOU shareholders and already privileged executives or corporations.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Kajsja Hendrickson to everyone: 1:47 PM

Involving communities in determining what programs need to be developed. So often the data determines what programs are made

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:48 PM

CPUC doesn't do proper oversight of private utility companies and Commissioners vote to protect the utility companies and their bottom line

from KRIKaLO to everyone: 1:48 PM

They are based on mainstream programs and agree they don't think about those details

Srinidhi Sampath Kumar to everyone: 1:50 PM

I think the San Joaquin Valley proceeding outreach process was pretty robust and strong. I still hear that those CBOs are not funded nearly enough to do the work after, in providing that on-going engagement. I think last evening's conversation on the CPUC process and how difficult it is to be an active party to proceeding is also telling in that CPUC needs to reach out to these communities more proactively and map out key partnerships.

from Julia to everyone: 1:50 PM

These ratepayer funds are put out to bid/RFP. For-profit companies go after the \$, designing programs to maximize their profit. Utilities choose the programs to maximize cost-effectiveness and their bottom lines. At no point is the customer or community part of the design of the program - I don't know that their needs are even really considered.

from Julia to everyone: 1:52 PM

CBOs and nonprofits, by their nature, design programs WITH and FOR communities. So working with them, first, is how to build equity in from the beginning.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:53 PM

Julia is correct

from LaBonte, Alison to everyone: 1:54 PM

thank you Julia. Any challenges or barriers you see with CBOs engaging in this effort that we will need to work to overcome?

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:55 PM

Private utilities and their shareholders are concerned about their bottom line and not about customers or their program needs even when they burn them out of their homes like PG&E who is a convicted criminal entity

from Julia to everyone: 1:56 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



Yes, @Alison - participating in the RFP process for 3rd party solicitations is extremely challenging for nonprofits, esp. when competing with big firms designed to do just that. It's simply not an even playing field. Same goes for engaging with the CPUC in general.

from Willie Calvin to everyone: 1:56 PM

Second Darshan's idea. An extension of Martha's transparency comment earlier

from Alice to everyone: 1:56 PM

^+@ Julia !!!!! The public goods charge monies could be equitably allocated to PUBLIC benefits and inclusive of prioritization of communities of need designing programs and BIPOC and people of those communities being paid to both design and implement. Technical assistance and other barriers could be addressed. prevent funding "Leakage" -- follow the money.

from Kajsia Hendrickson to everyone: 1:56 PM

Agree with Connie and what others have said. There is a fundamental disconnect to design a program to support communities but the process of getting those bids is more accessible to for profit IOUs who are going to design the programs with very different goals in mind

from sarahzsalem to everyone: 1:57 PM

also it is important to make sure CBO partnerships are no transaction but deeply rooted in time and trust and has resourcing such as funding connected to it

from sarahzsalem to everyone: 1:57 PM

not\*

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:57 PM

You need to use the same model of outreach like Blue Shield doing that looks at orgs in local communities of low income communities

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:58 PM

I can hear Alex and Whitney speaking

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:58 PM

talking over other speakers

from Julia to everyone: 1:58 PM

Also @Alison - if we're just looking at ESA (and I think we need to look beyond that), the payment structure is insufficient for participating nonprofits and I know of ones that have had to close their doors as a result

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:58 PM  
someone talking over meeting speakers

from Kajsa Hendrickson to everyone: 1:58 PM  
There needs to be more work on who determines what programs are even explored or developed. Find out from communities what THEY think needs to be addressed

from Mesrobian, Amy E. to everyone: 1:58 PM  
If you have any additional comments, please submit at: [ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov)

from Jorge De Ocampo to everyone: 1:59 PM  
Yes this chat will be saved.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:59 PM  
I can hear someone speaking over meeting speaker

from Alice to everyone: 1:59 PM  
Warning even on "allowing" CBOs to participate in the RFP process for these 3rd party IOU solicitations---the entire systyem of 3rd party administrators needs to be re-thought and re-designed, as by nature, the "competitive" nature and the close3d door "Selection" by IOUs is problematic!

from Julia to everyone: 1:59 PM  
Thank you!

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:59 PM  
What about public comment?

from Kim, Anne to everyone: 1:59 PM  
Thank you. :)

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 1:59 PM  
Integrated web cam someone said

from Mad Stano to everyone: 1:59 PM  
Thanks for the conversation.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 2:00 PM  
Two conversations happening over each other

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Anel Tovar to everyone: 2:00 PM  
Will there be a follow up meeting to this topic?

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 2:00 PM  
About background screen

from Jorge De Ocampo to everyone: 2:00 PM  
Please join into the main webex events from earlier

from Jorge De Ocampo to everyone: 2:00 PM  
Thank you all.

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 2:00 PM  
problems

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 2:00 PM  
Monica practice session

from Connie Arnold to everyone: 2:01 PM  
Weird

## **BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Safety & Enforcement**

from Matthew George to everyone: 12:58 PM  
Good Afternoon

from Nicole Cropper to everyone: 12:58 PM  
Good afternoon Matthew, thank you for joining

from Nicole Cropper to everyone: 1:05 PM  
We encourage you to use this chat to ask questions or raise your hand if you have a verbal comment.

from Nicole Cropper to everyone: 1:05 PM  
[www.esjactionplan@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:www.esjactionplan@cpuc.ca.gov)

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:07 PM  
Results up.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Matthew George to everyone: 1:32 PM

Penalties are either to drive behavior or reallocate resources

from Yvonne Chi to everyone: 1:33 PM

Examples of SEPs that benefit disadvantaged communities include: installing air filtration devices in schools, community centers, and residences to reduce the community's exposure to air pollution; monitoring groundwater quality from infiltrating stormwater to detect harmful contaminants; providing regular health screenings for affected communities; or providing community members training to enable them to identify environmental violations and to notify regulatory agencies of those violations.

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:33 PM

So if remedial acts or some sort of specific performance can benefit the aggrieved community, both goals would be accomplished

from Yvonne Chi to everyone: 1:35 PM

For example, the California Air Resources Board's SEP policy provides for a public process to solicit potential SEPs from disadvantaged communities themselves, and gives priority to projects in disadvantaged communities, and allows for the amount of the SEP to be up to 50 percent of the settlement penalties. Examples of potential SEPs that the Commission may adopt include free rooftop solar installations for low-income households and providing for broadband infrastructure to bridge the digital divide experienced by low-income communities, public housing, and others facing socioeconomic barriers.

from Yvonne Chi to everyone: 1:38 PM

Do you look at CalEnviroScreen's census tracts and environmental indicators to determine which communities are considered vulnerable and disadvantaged? SED can designate the census tracts that score at the highest 25 percent for environmental burdens as the communities in need of tailored enforcement actions. Maybe those communities can receive more safety audits? Perhaps the penalties for violations in these communities could be higher? Perhaps those communities can get quicker service.

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:39 PM

Would those ESJ concerns already be in the EIS or EIR?

from Yvonne Chi to everyone: 1:42 PM

Does SED collect data on these categories of safety issues, and also information on the racial and socioeconomic makeup of the communities affected by these safety issues?

from Carter Smith to everyone: 1:44 PM

Keep on your mayor

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC





# California Public Utilities Commission



from ctsang to everyone: 1:44 PM

City and County usually take care of the local street lighting issues.

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:45 PM

SB 1 also funded an Active Transportation Program; see <http://rebuildingca.ca.gov/programs.html>. Sidewalks are eligible

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:48 PM

Are you working with HCD to identify parks with violations in other areas?

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:49 PM

Housing & Community Development

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:50 PM

They also regulate mobile home parks

from Nicole Cropper to everyone: 1:54 PM

[nicole.cropper@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:nicole.cropper@cpuc.ca.gov)

from Nicole Cropper to everyone: 1:55 PM

[esjactionplan@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:esjactionplan@cpuc.ca.gov)

from Yvonne Chi to everyone: 1:57 PM

Thank you!

from Matthew George to everyone: 1:57 PM

Thank you!

from Vanna Bodine to everyone: 1:57 PM

Thank you

from Vanna Bodine to everyone: 1:58 PM

Thank you, Nicole

## **BREAKOUT SESSIONS: ESJ in CPUC Industry Divisions → Water**

from Palmeira, Monica to everyone: 1:06 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



Email: [ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:ESJActionPlan@cpuc.ca.gov)

from OWENSSW to everyone: 1:24 PM  
hand raised

from Ikle, Judith to everyone: 1:25 PM  
Some of the discussion this morning seemed to indicate that Cost Benefit Analysis itself as a construct might undermine some of the equity objectives of the ESJ Plan.

from Edward Simon to everyone: 1:47 PM  
Hi Monica Palmeira - Ed Simon. I would like to follow-up with you on how CWA can engage in the CPUC workforce diversity efforts. If you would send me your email address I can arrange an off-line discussion. – Thanks

from Palmeira, Monica to everyone: 1:48 PM  
Sure! I am at [Monica.Palmeira@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:Monica.Palmeira@cpuc.ca.gov) look forward to chatting more! We can also loop in Stephanie Green.

from Edward Simon to everyone: 1:49 PM  
Great. Thanks!

from Edward Simon to everyone: 1:56 PM  
Thanks for scheduling these calls around environmental and social justice - a very important topic. Glad to see CA addressing these long standing issues in particular the social justice piece.

from Lauren James to everyone: 1:56 PM  
Agreed, thank you.

## **Making the Most of Marketing, Education & Outreach (ME&O): Maximizing Impact and Aligning Strategies**

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 2:01 PM  
Hi everyone, we will get started shortly thank you!

from leslie martinez to everyone: 2:30 PM  
I also think it is very important to ensure that CBOs are being compensated for their work. Community engagement is a skill that takes a lot of work.

from Whitney Richardson to everyone: 2:36 PM  
Sorry about that everyone

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



from Martita Armas to everyone: 2:39 PM  
im here

from Martita Armas to everyone: 2:39 PM  
my hand is up

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:43 PM  
Bravo, love that comment. Does the CPUC have a reference list of CBOs throughout the state that you can easily filter by location in order to engage or invite to relevant proceedings?

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 2:47 PM  
I will say we have our Business and Community OUTreach Liaisons that have lists by region.

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 2:48 PM  
Find them here: <https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/General.aspx?id=2004>

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:51 PM  
Thank you for this link, Monica! Is there a list of NGOs publically accessible? or the liaisons have their own lists?

from Charles Mason to everyone: 2:51 PM  
The News and Outreach Local Government Liaisons have a comprehensive list of CBOs statewide. Monica's link above can get you to us all...

from Sarah Sharpe to everyone: 2:55 PM  
If there are new groups who are not on our list, please contact our News and Outreach team to make sure we have your contact info, although if you participated in this workshop I assume we have your email. Thanks everyone!

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:56 PM  
Thanks Sarah! I'm on the page that Monica shared, but I'm not finding the list of groups who the liaisons have cultivated. Can you help me get to the right place?

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 2:57 PM  
That list is just who are liaisons are, who keep lists for their territories. They do the hard work to reach out to stakeholders to involve them in our proceedings and processes.

from Monica Palmeira to all attendees: 2:58 PM  
\*Who our liaisons are

from Charles Mason to everyone: 2:58 PM

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC



# California Public Utilities Commission



It is not posted on the website. You can reach to me or the regional liaison in your area. My email is [charles.mason@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:charles.mason@cpuc.ca.gov)

from Alexandra McGee to everyone: 2:58 PM  
Understood. Thank you for clarifying, Charles! I'll reach out.

Protecting California since 1911

The CPUC regulates privately owned electric, natural gas, telecommunications, water, railroad, rail transit, and passenger transportation companies.



@CaliforniaPUC